

- *Gender in Debate from the Early Middle Ages to the Renaissance*  
edited by Thelma S. Fenster and Clare A. Lees
- *Malory's Morte Darthur: Remaking Arthurian Tradition*  
by Catherine Batt
- *The Vernacular Spirit: Essays on Medieval Religious Literature*  
edited by Renate Blumenfeld-Kosinski, Duncan Robertson, and Nancy Warren
- *Popular Piety and Art in the Late Middle Ages: Image Worship and Idolatry in England 1350-1500*  
by Kathleen Kamerick
- *Absent Narratives, Manuscript Textuality, and Literary Structure in Late Medieval England*  
by Elizabeth Scala
- *Creating Community with Food and Drink in Merovingian Gaul*  
by Bonnie Effros
- *Representations of Early Byzantine Empresses: Image and Empire*  
by Anne McClanan
- *Encountering Medieval Textiles and Dress: Objects, Texts, Images*  
edited by Désirée G. Koslin and Janet Snyder
- *Eleanor of Aquitaine: Lord and Lady*  
edited by Bonnie Wheeler and John Carmi Parsons
- *Isabel La Católica, Queen of Castile: Critical Essays*  
edited by David A. Boruchoff
- *Homoeroticism and Chivalry: Discourses of Male Same-Sex Desire in the Fourteenth Century*  
by Richard Zeikowitz
- *Portraits of Medieval Women: Family, Marriage, and Politics in England 1225-1350*  
by Linda E. Mitchell
- *Eloquent Virgins: From Thecla to Joan of Arc*  
by Maud Burnett McInerney
- *The Persistence of Medievalism: Narrative Adventures in Contemporary Culture*  
by Angela Jane Weisl
- *Capetian Women*  
edited by Kathleen Nolan
- *Joan of Arc and Spirituality*  
edited by Ann W. Astell and Bonnie Wheeler
- *The Texture of Society: Medieval Women in the Southern Low Countries*  
edited by Ellen E. Kittell and Mary A. Suydam
- *Charlemagne's Mustache: And Other Cultural Clusters of a Dark Age*  
by Paul Edward Dutton
- *Troubled Vision: Gender, Sexuality, and Sight in Medieval Text and Image*  
edited by Emma Campbell and Robert Mills
- *Queering Medieval Genres*  
by Tison Pugh
- *Sacred Place in Early Medieval Neoplatonism*  
by L. Michael Harrington
- *The Middle Ages at Work*  
edited by Kellie Robertson and Michael Uebel
- *Chaucer's Jobs*  
by David R. Carlson
- *Medievalism and Orientalism: Three Essays on Literature, Architecture and Cultural Identity*  
by John M. Ganim
- *Queer Love in the Middle Ages*  
by Anna Klosowska Roberts

LL  
GT  
575  
M43E  
2004

# Medieval Fabrications

Dress, Textiles, Clothwork, and Other Cultural Imaginings



Edited by E. Jane Burns

palgrave  
macmillan

than whole *garments* that necessarily would have remained frozen in time as rare and exotic souvenirs of a journey, these *textiles* and costume details served a transformative function, repositioning the European aristocracy and clergy visually at the nexus of an important cultural crossing with the East. After the mid-twelfth century, what Europeans perceived as the misfortunes of the Second and Third Crusades, greater availability of exotic goods in the Fairs of Champagne and Brie,<sup>50</sup> and the fragile associations of the elite with the luxuries of the Holy Land faded, and fashions in courtly clothing shifted away from imported Islamic goods, a shift reflected in sculpture as well.

*Ten*

## Almería Silk and the French Feudal Imaginary

### Toward a “Material” History of the Medieval Mediterranean

Sharon Kinoshita

**J**ust after their marriage, Chrétien de Troyes’s protagonists Erec and Enide lead a procession to church, where Erec donates 60 silver marks and a gold crucifix containing a piece of the True Cross once belonging to Emperor Constantine. Enide then approaches the altar, prays for the birth of an heir, and makes her offering:<sup>1</sup>

Puis a ofert desor l’autel  
*un paisle vert*, nus ne vit tel,  
 et une grant chasuble ovree;  
 tote a fin or estoit brodee,  
 et ce fu veritez provee  
 que l’uevre an fist Morgue la fee  
 el Val Perilleus, ou estoit;

grant antante mise i avoit.  
 D'or fu de soie d'Aumarie;  
 la fee fet ne l'avoit mie  
 a oes chasuble por chanter,  
 mes son ami la volt doner  
 por feire riche vestemant,  
 car a mervoille ert avenant;  
 Ganievre, par engin molt grant,  
 la fame Artus le roi puissant,  
 l'ot par l'empereor Gassa;  
 une chasuble feite an a,  
 si l'ot maint jor en sa chapele  
 por ce que boene estoit et bele;  
 quant Enide de li torna,  
 cele chasuble li dona;  
 qui la verité an diroit,  
 plus de cent mars d'argent valoit. (2353-76, emphasis added)

[Then she placed on the altar a green *paille*, the likes of which no one had seen, and a great embroidered chasuble all embroidered in pure gold. It was well known that Morgan la Fay had made it in Val Perilleus. She had taken great care over it. It was of gold Almería silk. The fairy hadn't at all made it to be a chasuble to sing mass in, but wanted to give it to her lover to make a rich garment out of. Through a clever scheme, Guenevere, wife of the powerful King Arthur, got it through Emperor Gassa. She had a chasuble made from it, and had kept it in her chapel for a long time, for it was good and beautiful. When Enide left her, she gave her this chasuble; in truth, it was worth more than a hundred silver marks.]

In medieval French epic and romance, Almerían silks—and indeed silks in general—were synonymous with luxury. Both the beautiful Saracen princess Nubie in *La Prise de Cordres et de Seville* and the countess of Vermandois in *Raoul de Cambrai* wear a “mantel d'Aumarie”—the latter giving hers away as a reward to a messenger who brings her good news;

“paille d'Aumarie” is used for the banners borne into battle by Guielin (l. 1368) and by King Louis of France in *Le Siège de Barbastre*; and “soies d'Aumarie” festoon the streets of Saint-Quentin to welcome home the countess of Vermandois's long-lost son.<sup>2</sup> In the scene quoted above, Enide's pious donation illustrates the historical practice of converting silks “used for secular purposes in the first instance” to liturgical use, even as the chasuble's fabulous history attests to the sense of wonder produced by such *soies d'Aumarie*.<sup>3</sup>

In Old French literature, E. Jane Burns writes, costly foreign fabrics are “visual maps” pointing to sites that provided the sumptuous goods that marked “elite social status.”<sup>4</sup> In this essay, I take the fascination Almerían silks exerted on the feudal imaginary as a point of entry into material histories of interconfessional contact and exchange in the medieval Mediterranean.<sup>5</sup> For unlike Byzantine silks, the *soies d'Aumarie* found in church treasuries and noble wardrobes throughout the West had to cross a religious and cultural divide between Latin Europe and the Islamic world. In recent years, medieval historians, art historians, and literary critics have elucidated the complexity of Christian, Muslim, and Jewish interactions in the high middle ages. Yet the perception of a Latin Europe arrayed in perpetual conflict against the Muslim world has had a long-half life, particularly in work focused on Christian (mis)representations of Islam.<sup>6</sup> It is true, as recent studies usefully remind us, that in the middle ages religion, not race, functioned as a primary marker of identity and difference.<sup>7</sup> Yet this distinction itself runs the risk of being too quickly reified into the optic through which to view the totality of medieval history. The treasured place accorded silks like Enide's in vernacular French culture squares poorly with the assumption that medieval Christian-Muslim relations during this age of crusades were exclusively, or even predominantly, conflictual. Following the routes that brought *soie d'Aumarie* to Latin Europe allows us to reimagine the denizens of the medieval Mediterranean not (only) as Christians and Muslims, but as kings, courtiers, diplomats, mercenaries, and merchants, whose experiences, travels, and affinities often crossed confessional lines. Once we relinquish the *a priori* assumption of a civilizational standoff, there emerges a multifaceted history of interaction and exchange.

## I

Sericulture was introduced to the Iberian peninsula sometime after the Muslim conquest of the early eighth century. Under the Umayyads, Córdoba was the center of Andalusian production. As in other production centers around the Mediterranean and in the Near East, the best silks were produced in strictly controlled palace workshops for use in elaborate court rituals, or to be distributed as diplomatic gifts and ceremonial robes of honor. Soon, however, commercial workshops began producing silks in a wide range of qualities for more general sale and consumption. By the tenth century, Andalusian silks were being exported to Fatimid Egypt, where they figured among the gifts the caliphs bestowed on their retainers.<sup>8</sup> After the fall of the Caliphate (1031), the lead in silk production passed from Córdoba to Almería, a flourishing commercial and industrial center on the southeastern coast of the Iberian peninsula. Under the Almoravids, 800 factories were turning out fabrics of diverse and distinctive designs, some imitated from well-known eastern centers like Isfahan, Jurjân, and Baghdad.<sup>9</sup> A purple silk popular with French merchants appears in the “bliaut de porpre d’Aumarie” worn by the epic heroine in *Aye d’Avignon*, and perhaps in the “porpre noir” worn by the warrior queen Camille in the *Roman d’Enéas*.<sup>10</sup> Among the best-known *soie d’Aumarie* were the patterned silks, decorated with rows of roundels, called *pallia rotata* in Latin and *paille roé* in vernacular French. Inside the roundels were human figures, like the mounted falconer on the shroud of Saint Lazarus and the chasuble of Saint Thomas Becket,<sup>11</sup> or the mirror-image pairs of confronted (face-to-face) or addorsed (back-to-back) animals, often separated by a stylized tree of life: peacocks (on the lampas weave silk found with the relics of Saint Cuthbert at Durham), lions (on the chasuble of San Juan de Ortega), lions and harpies (on the shroud of San Pedro de Osma), and griffins (on a silk wrapped around the relics of Santa Librada at Sigüenza).<sup>12</sup> The colors are typically “dull orange-red for the decoration, with green or blue on an ivory ground,” highlighted by touches of gold. Many of the silks bore Arabic inscriptions in stylized Kufic script,

repeating words like “prosperity” (on the “Lion Strangler”) or “perfect blessing” (on the cope of Robert of Anjou).<sup>13</sup>

As these examples indicate, most of the Almerían silks we possess today survived as ecclesiastical garments or as wrappings for the relics of saints. One such piece, particularly relevant to the passage from Chrétien de Troyes which opened this essay, is the chasuble of Saint Edmund Rich from the abbey of Saint Jacques in Provins.<sup>14</sup> A green lampas decorated with addorsed parrots, it is, like Enide’s first offering, “un paisle vert” (2354); like her second, it is made of *soie d’Aumarie*. The roundel is adorned with the words “Glory to God” in stylized Arabic script.<sup>15</sup> Such inscriptions, so frequently found on Andalusian silks, evoke the incongruous spectacle of “clergymen and crusaders” arrayed in “glowing ceremonial garments, where the praise of Allah was embroidered in the ‘tiraz’ (decorative silk bands), in words luckily unintelligible to most of the bearers of such a cloth.”<sup>16</sup>

What would such silks have meant to a contemporary audience? The display of silks acquired as spoils of war may have served to proclaim the triumph of the victors over the vanquished.<sup>17</sup> But in medieval Iberia, “religious ideology did not control all aspects of cultural interaction” and, as art historian Jerrilynn Dodds underscores, “the complex interrelations and tensions” between Christians and Muslims are part of what made the arts of this period “rich and original.” In this period, the frontier between the Christian kingdoms and al-Andalus was less a “hard-and-fast line between opposed camps” than a “permeable zone” crossed by soldiers of fortune, political exiles, high-ranking churchmen, merchants, and eccentric monks. Political dealings between Christians and Muslims were regulated by “a degree of mutual restraint” marked by treaties and shifting alliances.<sup>18</sup> The most famous example was “the Cid”—Rodrigo Díaz de Vivar, the Castilian exile who served the Muslim king of Zaragoza before conquering the kingdom of Valencia for himself. But such cross-confessional alliances were not unusual in the history of medieval Iberia, where commonalities of rank and self-interest could supersede religious difference.<sup>19</sup> The armies responsible for the Cordoban general al-Mansur’s devastating raids on the Christian kingdoms of Iberia, for example, included “numerous Christians who were well

treated and permitted to celebrate their festivals even on campaign," and who, like their Muslim counterparts, received fine pieces of *tiraz* (decorative silk bands) and other silks as their reward.<sup>20</sup>

Such cross-confessional connections and entanglements are well-known to scholars of medieval Iberia and the Mediterranean. However, for the majority of Anglo-American medievalists focused on the more northerly cultures of England, Germany, or France, these complications remain hidden in plain sight: vaguely known but rarely assimilated, obscured by our own modern disciplinary divides.<sup>21</sup> Yet northern adventurers like Ebles de Roucy and Rotrou de Perche who crossed the Pyrenees entered a world in which both Christian and Muslim rulers managed their affairs with a political pragmatism at odds with the emerging discourse of crusades, and in which Mediterranean silks served less frequently as trophies of Christian victories over Islam than as signifiers of power, luxury, and prestige.<sup>22</sup> Their Islamic origins notwithstanding, Andalusian silks figured among "the finest material in which holy Christian relics could be wrapped."<sup>23</sup> At Durham, the remains of the Anglo-Saxon Saint Cuthbert were enveloped in a purple silk brocade embroidered, in Arabic, with the first half of the Muslim profession of faith, together with Byzantine silks probably originally transported to the West as a diplomatic gift.<sup>24</sup> In church treasuries throughout the Latin West, the apparently indiscriminate mixing of Muslim and Byzantine silks suggests that possession of *soies d'Aumarie* signified, not Christian triumphalism, but the highest opulence—as in the *Roman d'Enéas*, where Camille's tomb is adorned with Almerian along with purple Caffan silk, the feathers of a magical bird, and a sable edged with imperial (Byzantine) purple (ll. 7365-7724).

In the *Roman d'Enéas*, the magical agency of the ".III. faees serours" [three fairy sisters] to whom the golden embroidery on Camille's purple dress is attributed—like the "grant antante" (l. 2360) Morgan la Fay had invested in embroidering the silk for her lover—bespeaks a desire to mystify the origins of *soies d'Aumarie*.<sup>25</sup> Yet by the second half of the twelfth century, Almería had clearly established its hold on the French imaginary. In *La Prise d'Orange*, the architectural marvels of Orable's tower Gloriete are attributed to Grifaigne d'Aumarie, "Uns Sarrazins de mout tres grant

voidie" [a Saracen of very great skill] (1162-1163).<sup>26</sup> And in Chrétien de Troyes's *Cligés* (ca. 1180), the protagonist's encounter with his beloved Fénice is recounted in the following terms: "S'or fust Cligés dus d'Aumarie, / Ou de Marroc, ou de Tudele, / Ne prisast il une cenele / Avers la joie que il a" [had he been duke of Almería, of Morocco, or Tudela, he wouldn't have given a *cenele* against his present bliss].<sup>27</sup> In the eyes of this half-Byzantine, half-Arthurian prince, the silks of the Muslim Mediterranean are the ultimate value against which his love's worth can be measured.

## II

Both Almería and the silks it produced belonged to the larger "Mediterranean society" reconstructed in such remarkable detail by historian S. D. Goitein from the accidental archive of the Cairo Geniza.<sup>28</sup> In the eleventh and twelfth centuries, the Mediterranean was a space of "relatively free trade" pervaded by "a spirit of tolerance and liberalism." On both its northern and southern shores, the activity of "a vigorous merchant class . . . created an atmosphere of unity despite the constant wars and political upheavals." Journeys—even regular seasonal commutes—from Almería to Alexandria or from Marseilles to the Levant were a common experience. From Tunisia to Egypt, Latin Europeans came to buy pepper, cinnamon, ginger, brazilwood, alum, flax, indigo, and other commodities in numbers great enough to affect market prices.<sup>29</sup> In this medieval Mediterranean, textiles were the major commodity and the major industry, with silk the most important of all. Geniza records document at least 12 different varieties, distinguished by quality, technique, and place of origin. Bundled into ten-pound units, a standard grade silk (whose price remained stable ca. 1030-1150) was used like cash: as payment for debts incurred in the India trade, as stipends to needy relatives, and as capital investments; "everyone, in addition to his substantial business, dabbled in silk." Goitein adds: "To conclude from their writings, the Geniza people must have devoted a considerable part of their lives to discussing which kind of silk to choose for which garment and for which occasion."<sup>30</sup>

At elite levels, fine silks played a symbolically central role in political culture. In the early Islamic period, tributes were frequently paid in fabrics and clothing.

At court luxurious textiles and dress displayed the authority, prosperity and prestige of the regime, and so were frequently sent as diplomatic gifts between rulers. . . . Instead of handing out medals in recognition of service, the ruler generally bestowed gifts of clothing (*khi'l'a*), whose value depended on the status of the recipient. Supporters of the regime were expected to wear a certain colour or item of dress, and neglect or refusal to do so signified withdrawal of allegiance.<sup>31</sup>

In Latin Europe, the prestige attached to gifts of fine silks had been set in the early middle ages by the ceremonial robes Byzantine emperors sent to the barbarian kings of the West.<sup>32</sup> In medieval Iberia, such gifts were used to cement cross-confessional alliances.<sup>33</sup> And in the literary imagination, the distribution of silk was figured as part of a tributary economy of munificent excess, as in the *Roman d'Alexandre* (ca. 1180), where "pailles d'Aumarie" and "siglatons d'Espagne" (162) figure among the Antiochene diaspers, Byzantine samites, Russian furs, Arabian horses, Syrian mules, and Hungarian palFREYS that Alexander's mother Olympias distributes to her favorites.<sup>34</sup>

From the tenth through twelfth centuries, silks and other luxury objects—carved ivory panels and caskets, nielloed boxes, bronze zomorphic statues, rock crystal vases—circulated around the Mediterranean in what art historian Oleg Grabar has called a "shared culture of objects."<sup>35</sup> As art historian Eva Hoffman explains:

The Fatimids, Byzantines, Normans and Umayyads in Spain flourished and competed in close proximity around the Mediterranean. Each sponsored its own impressive literary, scientific, artistic and commercial centres, and no single power dominated the others. The energetic competition between these powers sometimes took the form of military conflict but for the most part the rivalry was played out through commerce and diplomacy. The constant traffic of people and goods, at court level through gifts and at

merchant-class level through trade, proved an effective recipe for sustaining a fragile co-existence and a delicate balance of power.<sup>36</sup>

The motifs characterizing this shared culture of objects were already old in the eleventh century. The circular designs giving *pallia rotata* their name appear ca. 700 on silks from Baghdad, Iran, Alexandria, and Byzantium.<sup>37</sup> The figures they contain are even older, derived from the ancient Near East, transmitted through Alexander's empire and its successor states to Byzantium and Sassanian Persia, and disseminated by the spread of Islam in the seventh and eighth centuries. The mirror-imaged animals flanking a tree of life, for example, derive from ancient Mesopotamia, while the "lion strangler" on the dalmatic of San Bernardo Calvó has been identified as Gilgamesh.<sup>38</sup> Images of the princely life (like the falconer on the Saint Lazarus and Thomas Becket silks) were first articulated as a cycle under the Umayyad caliphs of Baghdad. They came to constitute a "vast *koiné* of artistic themes," an international style whose courtly motifs could cross confessional boundaries in ways religious iconography could not.<sup>39</sup> Portable treasures like ivory boxes, rock crystal vases, metal statuettes, lusterware ceramics, and, of course, fine silks circulated from one end of the Mediterranean to the other, spreading techniques and designs so freely as to render modern attempts to identify the provenance of any particular object difficult, if not irrelevant.<sup>40</sup> Around the Mediterranean, the "patronage and the possession" of such objects became a "sign of sovereignty."<sup>41</sup> Highly susceptible of imitation and appropriation, these portable treasures became emblematic of the princely life they both enabled and depicted.

In this perspective, it is not hard to imagine that for the feudal princes of Latin Europe, to possess and display Almerían silks was to share in the wealth and sophistication of the Mediterranean cultures that produced them. By the twelfth century, the power exerted by the ceremonial culture of the Mediterranean may be gauged by the central role it played in the foundation of the Norman kingdom of Sicily. When the upstart count Roger II assumed the title of king in 1130, he adopted an iconography not from the Capetian or Ottonian north but from the ceremonial courts of Constantinople and Cairo. His strategic appropri-

ation of Mediterranean forms is exemplified in the Palatine Chapel of his palace at Palermo, where walls decorated with Byzantine-style mosaics depicting Christian scenes are covered by a *muqarnas* ceiling painted with dancers and musicians drawn from the repertoire of images characterizing Grabar's "shared culture of objects."<sup>42</sup> Nothing better illustrates Roger's appeal to these Mediterranean forms than his coronation mantle, a large semicircle of red silk studded with pearls and cloisonné enamel. The center of the cloak was marked by a large, stylized palm tree, embroidered in gold. On either side are mirror images of a lion attacking a camel, combining the motif of symmetrically disposed animals we have earlier seen on *soies d'Aumarie* with a second motif, also drawn from the shared culture of objects, of one animal dominating another. An Arabic inscription around the border of the mantle proclaims it was made in the year 528 (1133-1134) in the workshop of the king's palace in Palermo; the workshop is described as filled with "joy, honor, good fortune, perfection, long life, profit, good welcome, prosperity, splendor, glory," and other exemplary qualities. Like the magnificent Cappella Palatina, the mantle proclaims the king's majesty in a visual language of power legible across the Mediterranean.<sup>43</sup>

In our civilizational histories of the medieval West, emphasis typically falls on England, France, and the German Empire, relegating Christian Iberia and Norman Sicily to the margins of Latin Europe.<sup>44</sup> Yet in the twelfth century, as Robert Bartlett has shown, the culture of "Europe" was still very much under construction.<sup>45</sup> The example of Roger II suggests an alternate mapping which casts western Europe itself as peripheral to the "shared culture" of the medieval Mediterranean.<sup>46</sup> In this conceptual reterritorialization, the Iberian peninsula and Norman Sicily—marginalized precisely because their political, social, and cultural hybridity squares so poorly with the genealogy of the modern nation-state—may be recoded as the Latin West's privileged points of access to the medieval Mediterranean.<sup>47</sup>

This turn of the geopolitical lens brings us back to Goitein's Geniza world of long distance trade routes traversed by merchants of all confessions, where letters sent from Almería to Alexandria cost one and a half dirhams.<sup>48</sup> This emphasis on trade, traffic, and interaction (rather

than on emergent states with their attendant proto-national cultures) brings to the fore a different set of historical actors who—like the Norman Sicilians—otherwise risk disappearing in the disciplinary divides separating medieval Europe from the Islamic world or the proto-national histories of Italy, France, or Spain. Central here are the Genoese, who sailed throughout the Mediterranean, building a maritime empire rivalling that of the Venetians. In the West, Almería was a regular port-of-call in the circuit comprising al-Andalus and the north-west coast of Africa.<sup>49</sup> Their policies toward the city opportunistically combined military aggression with a politics of accommodation. In 1137, they negotiated an agreement granting them trading rights throughout Almoravid lands (the first in a series of treaties renewed at regular intervals well into the thirteenth century). Ten years later, they joined in Alfonso VII of Castile's siege and capture of the city, sharing in the immense booty, which included large numbers of women and children subsequently sold on the slave markets of Marseille and Genoa.<sup>50</sup> When the Muslims (this time the Almohads) retook Almería in 1157, the Genoese simply reverted to business as usual, renegotiating treaties guaranteeing them access to Islamic Spain and the Maghreb.<sup>51</sup> In the second half of the twelfth century, their ships came to dominate trade and transport in the western Mediterranean, carrying (among others) the celebrated Iberian travelers Benjamin of Tudela and Ibn Jubayr on their respective journeys (1160 and ca. 1185) to the East. At the same time, Genoese merchants could be found frequenting the famous trade fairs of Champagne, providing a tangible link between the Muslim Mediterranean, with its Almerian silks, and the northern milieu that was home to Chrétien de Troyes and Guiot de Provins.<sup>52</sup>

This commercial Mediterranean plied by the Genoese was clearly familiar to the authors of early French romance. In *Floire et Blancheflor* (ca. 1150), a Spanish Saracen king, working through a bourgeois intermediary "qui de marcié estoit molt sages / et sot parler de mains langages" [who knew a lot about markets and spoke many languages] (424-26), sells the heroine to some Egyptian merchants in exchange for cash, a golden goblet, and an inventory of precious silks.<sup>53</sup> In the prose romance *La fille du comte de Pontieu* (ca. 1220), a merchant ship sailing from Flanders, "qui

s'en aloit en tere de Sarrasins pour gaangnier" [heading for Saracen lands for profit] (237-38) docks in the port of Almería. Identifying themselves by neither "nationality" nor religion but by profession—"Marceant somes" [We are merchants]—the sailors secure the sultan's good will by giving him the daughter of the count of Pontieu as a present, a gesture which evokes the slave trade so central to Mediterranean commerce in general and Genoese commerce in particular.<sup>54</sup> Swept into a world where identities prove fluid and negotiable, the count's daughter abandons her faith and learns fluent "sarrasinois" (l. 286), becoming sultana of Almería before (re)converting to Christianity and returning, triumphant, to the family and society that had expelled her. Like Blancheflor before her, she is revalued by her transit through the Mediterranean.

### Conclusions

Despite common modern assumptions about the age-old enmity between Islam and the "West," the history of the medieval Mediterranean demonstrates the inadequacy of catch-all terms like "Christian" and "Muslim" to apprehend the political and cultural complexity of the age. In contrast to the simple, static models through which we are tempted to think medieval cultural difference, the traces Islamic silks have left in Christian church treasuries and in vernacular French texts summon forth the necessity for different kinds of historical understanding. The visual paradox of a bishop clad in a chasuble of Almería silk reveals a complex aesthetic politics that pushes our presuppositions about the Latin middle ages to their limit. Once extricated from histories that privilege the official knowledge of polemical pronouncements over the lived practices of ambivalence and accommodation, *soies d'Aumarie* invite us to recognize the medieval world's multiple modalities of contact and exchange. In contrast to the "sheer knitted-together strength" and "redoubtable durability" Edward Said has attributed to Orientalist discourse, the material history of Almería silk gestures toward the Mediterranean as a site from which to "begin the process of unraveling of civilizational narratives."<sup>55</sup>

*Elesen*

## How Philosophy Matters

### Death, Sex, Clothes, and Boethius

Andrea Denny-Brown

Whence the necessity of 'reopening' the figures of philosophical discourse...in order to pry out of them what they have borrowed that is feminine, from the feminine, and make them 'render up' and give back what they owe the feminine.

—Luce Irigaray, *This Sex Which is Not One*

The meaning of Boethius's highly influential allegorical figure of Philosophy in his *Consolation of Philosophy* has been much discussed. The central linguistic fact is that she represents some form of wisdom or learning: *philosophia*, from *philein*, to love; and *sophia*, wisdom, means 'the love of wisdom.' That this wisdom is recorded in her garment also remains unchallenged: Following a distinction made by Boethius himself, the Greek letters Π and Θ on Philosophy's famous robe are generally understood as symbols of practical and speculative philosophy, the letters for which begin with *pi* and *theta*, respectively.<sup>1</sup> Yet the greater connotations of Philosophy's garment as a material marker have been neglected, in part

50. For a concise discussion of the cloth trade at the Fairs of Champagne, see E. Jane Burns, *Courtly Love Undressed, Reading through Clothes in Medieval French Culture* (Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2002), pp. 190-91.

### Notes to Chapter Ten

A grant from the Institute for Humanities Research at UC Santa Cruz aided in the preparation of this paper. My thanks to Brian Catlos, Will Crooke, Carla Freccero, Virginia Jansen, and Karen Mathews for advice of various kinds.

1. This passage occurs in an interpolation unique to BN 794, attributed to the scribe Guiot of Provins. Chrétien de Troyes, *Erec et Enide*, ed. Mario Roques (Paris: Champion, 1976), p. xlix.
2. *La Prise de Cordres et de Seville: Chanson de geste du XIIe siècle*, ed. Ovide Densusianu (Paris: Firmin Didot, 1896), l. 732; *Raoul de Cambrai*, ed. and trans. Sarah Kay (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1992), ll. 7998, 8003; *Le Siège de Barbastre*, ed. Bernard Guidot (Paris: Champion, 2000), ll. 1368, 4297-4300. The Old French term "paille," frequently used to designate silk, derives from the Latin "pallium"—an ecclesiastical mantle worn by archbishops and, by extension, the precious material out of which it is made.
3. Anna Muthesius, *Studies in Byzantine and Islamic Silk Weaving* (London: Pindar Press, 1995) p. 142. On silk chasubles, see p. 122.
4. E. Jane Burns, *Courtly Love Undressed: Reading Through Clothes in Medieval French Culture* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2002), chapter 6. My focus on silks from Islamic Almería complements Burns' study of eastern, Islamic and particularly Byzantine, silks, pp. 182-97.
5. "Imaginary" here and in my title translates the French *imaginaire*, the term used by Jacques Le Goff in his study of medieval mentalities, *L'Imaginaire médiéval* (Paris: Gallimard, 1985). See also Evelyne Patlagean, "L'Histoire de l'imaginaire" in *La Nouvelle Histoire*, ed. Jacques Le Goff (Paris: Retz CEPL, 1978; repr. Editions Complexe, 1988), pp. 307-34.
6. Edward W. Said, *Orientalism* (New York: Random House, 1978). In *Saracens: Islam in the Medieval European Imagination* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2002), John V. Tolan traces permutations in the medieval textual tradition.
7. See Robert Bartlett, "Medieval and Modern Concepts of Race and Ethnicity," *Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies* 31:1 (2001): 39-56.
8. R. B. Serjeant, *Islamic Textiles: Material for a History up to the Mongol Conquest* (Beirut: Librairie du Liban, 1972), p. 165.
9. Serjeant, *Islamic Textiles*, p. 170, quoting from the *Book of Roger*, written by the Muslim geographer al-Idrisi for King Roger II of Sicily (of whom more below) in the mid-twelfth century.
10. May, *Silk Textiles of Spain: Eighth to Fifteenth Century* (New York: Hispanic Society of America, 1957), p. 12; *Aye d'Avignon: chanson de geste anonyme*, ed. S. J. Borg, *Textes Littéraires Français* (Geneva: Droz, 1967), l. 916; and *Le Roman d'Enéas*, ed. and trans. Aimé Petit (Paris: Livre de Poche, 1997), l. 4099.
11. On the shroud of Saint Lazarus, the falconer roundels alternate with roundels containing a sphinx. *Les Andalouses: de Damas à Cordoue* (Paris: Institut du Monde Arabe, 2000), pp. 136-37. The inscription "al-Muzaffar" on the falconer's belt, an honorific title granted to the Córdoba vizier Abd al-Malik, dates the silk to 1007-1008. Eva Baer, "The *Suaire de St. Lazare*: An Early Datable Hispano-Islamic Embroidery," *Oriental Art* 13 (1967): 36-37 [36-48]. An inscription on the Becket chasuble says it was made in Almería in A.H. 510 (1116). Annabelle Simon-Cahn, "The Fermo Chasuble of St. Thomas Becket and Hispano-Mauresque Cosmological Silks: Some Speculations on the Adaptive Reuse of Textiles," *Muqarnas* 10 (1993), 1 [1-5].
12. For the Durham silk, see Muthesius, *Byzantine and Islamic Silk Weaving*, pp. 89-93. The other examples are from Cristina Partearroyo, "Almoravid and Almohad Textiles," in *Al-Andalus: The Art of Islamic Spain*, ed. Jerrilynn D. Dodds (New York: Metropolitan Museum of Art, 1992), pp. 106-7 [105-13].
13. Partearroyo, "Textiles," pp. 105-6. This list exemplifies the heterogeneity of modern nomenclature, which might identify a silk by the saint or prelate with whom it has been associated, the site where it was uncovered, or a distinctive motif or design.
14. Provins was the site of one of the great trade fairs of Champagne, as well as the home of Guiot de Provins, presumed author of the interpolation recounting Enide's donation. The chasuble's association with the abbey of Saint Jacques suggests a possible link to the Santiago pilgrimage.
15. Though Edmund Rich, archbishop of Canterbury, died in 1241, the silk is dated to the twelfth century on stylistic grounds. Daniel Walker, "Chasuble of Saint Edmund," in *The Art of Medieval Spain, A.D. 500-1200* (New York: Metropolitan Museum of Art, 1993), p. 107. For a technical description of lampas weave, see Scott, *Book of Silk* (London: Thames and Hudson, 1933), pp. 101, 238.
16. Robert S. Lopez, "Mohammed and Charlemagne: A Revision," *Speculum* 18:1 (1943): 37 [14-38].
17. According to tradition, the two pieces found wrapping the relics of Santa Librada in Sigüenza were taken during Alfonso VII of Castile's conquest of Almería (of which more below). Similarly, the "Lion Stranger," part of the dalmatic of San Bernardo Calvó, bishop of Vich (in Catalonia), is thought to have been taken during James I of Aragon's conquest of Valencia (1238). Partearroyo, "Almoravid and Almohad Textiles," in *Al-Andalus*, p. 107.
18. R. A. Fletcher, "Reconquest and Crusade in Spain c. 1050-1150," *Transactions of the Royal Historical Society*, Fifth Series, 37 (1987): 35-36.
19. For a literary representation of such an alliance, see Sharon Kinoshita, "Fraternalizing with the Enemy: The Crusader Imaginary in *Raoul de Cambrai*," in *L'Épopée médiévale: Actes du XVe Congrès International de la Société Rencesvals*. Vol. 2 (Poitiers: Centre d'Études Supérieures de Civilisation Médiévale, 2002), pp. 695-703. For an inverse example, see Brian A. Catlos, "Mahomet Abenadalill': A Muslim Mercenary in the Service of the Kings of Aragon (1290-1291)," in *In and Around the Medieval Crown of Aragon: Studies in Honor of Professor Elena Lourie*, ed. Harvey Hames (Leiden, the Netherlands: Brill, forthcoming).
20. Joseph F. O'Callaghan, *A History of Medieval Spain* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1975), p. 127; R. B. Serjeant, *Islamic Textiles*, p. 169.
21. On the marginalization of the Iberian peninsula in "postcolonial medievalism," see Kathleen Biddick, "Coming Out of Exile: Dante on the Orient Express" in *The Postcolonial Middle Ages*, ed. Jeffrey Jerome Cohen (New York: Palgrave, 2000), p. 16, n49 [35-52], and Bruce Holsinger, "Medieval Studies, Postcolonial Studies, and the Genealogies of Critique," *Speculum* 77 (2002): 1202-03 [1195-1227].
22. Ebles was a Champenois noble who took part in the campaign Pope Gregory VII called against Spanish Muslims. His sister Félicie married King Sancho (1063-1094) of Aragon, making him the maternal uncle of kings Peter I and Alfonso the Battler. Rotrou of Perche (in Normandy), who served in Alfonso's Ebro valley campaigns, was another nephew, son of Ebles's sister Béatrice. Marcelin Defourneaux, *Les Français en Espagne aux XIe et XIIe siècles* (Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1949).

23. Dodds, *Art of Islamic Spain*, p. 33.
24. Alice E. Lasater, *Spain to England: A Comparative Study of Arabic, European, and English Literature of the Middle Ages* (Jackson: University Press of Mississippi, 1974), 3; Muthesius, *Byzantine and Islamic Silk Weaving*, pp. 77-104.
25. Contrast the notorious Pesme Avanture episode of Chrétien de Troyes's *Le Chevalier au Lion*, in which the manufacture of silk is shown to be the work of three hundred exploited captive maidens. *Le Chevalier au Lion*, ed. Mario Roques (Paris: Champion, 1978), ll. 5182-5340.
26. *La Prise d'Orange: chanson de geste de la fin du XIIIe siècle*, 7th ed (Paris: Klincksieck, 1986). In laisse 42, Aumarie is described as "la cité d'Aufrique," capital of the pagan king Tiebaut d'Esclavonie.
27. Chrétien de Troyes, *Cligés*, ed. Alexandre Micha (Paris: Champion, 1978), ll. 6248-51 (emphasis added). Tudela, in the Ebro valley, had been conquered by Alfonso I of Aragon in 1119.
28. The Geniza was a tower, once common in medieval synagogues, used to store unwanted documents until they could be properly buried. (No writing bearing God's name could be destroyed.) In the late nineteenth century, the geniza in Old Cairo was found to contain, in addition to valuable manuscripts, a huge cache of letters, marriage contracts, bills of divorce, legal deeds, court records, business accounts, wills, inventories, horoscopes, and children's writing exercises, written mostly in Judeo-Arabic, dating from the eleventh and twelfth centuries. From these textual fragments, Goitein has pieced together a world in which Jewish merchants based in Fatimid Egypt maintained networks of trading partners and correspondents stretching from Almería in the west to the Malabar coast of India in the east. See S. D. Goitein, *A Mediterranean Society: The Jewish Communities of the Arab World as Portrayed in the Documents of the Cairo Geniza*, 5 vols. (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1967-93), 1: 1-16.
29. Goitein, *Mediterranean Society*, 1: 29, 42, 44-45, 70.
30. Goitein, *Mediterranean Society*, 1: 104, 222-23; 4: 167. Silk was often the object of official trade embargoes, "calculated to inflict maximum economic damage." Patricia L. Baker, *Islamic Textiles* (London: British Museum Press, 1995), pp. 14-15.
31. Baker, *Islamic Textiles*, p. 15. On investiture as a "metalanguage" of power with a long genealogy, originating in Asia and widespread throughout the medieval Mediterranean, see the essays collected in *Robes and Honor: The Medieval World of Investiture*, ed. Stewart Gordon (New York: Palgrave, 2001).
32. Constantinople's strict control over the circulation and export of such silks enhanced their symbolic value. Lopez, "Mohammed and Charlemagne," 37. Compare Anna Muthesius's felicitous term, "silken diplomacy." See "Silken Diplomacy" in *Byzantine Diplomacy: Papers from the Twenty-fourth Spring Symposium of Byzantine Studies, Cambridge, March 1990*, ed. Jonathan Shepard and Simon Franklin (Aldershot, England: Variorum, 1992), pp. 237-48.
33. Caliph al-Hakam II (961-76) bestowed silks on both Ordoño IV of León and Count Borrell I of Barcelona during their respective visits to Córdoba. May, *Silk Textiles*, p. 9.
34. Alexandre de Paris, *Le Roman d'Alexandre*, ed. E. C. Armstrong, trans. Laurence Harf-Lancner, *Lettres Gothiques* (Paris: Livre de Poche, 1994), pp. 159-65. Antioch was known for its brocades with fantastic animals and birds, highlighted in gold. Philippa Scott, *Book of Silk*, p. 96. On the complicated history and etymology of "siglaton" (from the Arabic *siqlatun*), see Lombard, *Textiles*, pp. 242-43 (but contrast Scott, *Book of Silk*, p. 99). According to Lombard, the *siqlatun* of Almería, like that of Antioch, was red.
35. Oleg Grabar, "The Shared Culture of Objects," *Byzantine Court Culture from 829 to 1204*, ed. Henry Maguire (Washington, D.C.: Dumbarton Oaks, 1997), pp. 115-29.
- For examples, see *The Art of Medieval Spain*, pp. 80-81, 94-96, 98-100, 103, 273-76 and *Les Trésors fatimides du Caire* (Paris: Institut du Monde Arabe, 1998).
36. Eva R. Hoffman, "Pathways of Portability: Islamic and Christian Interchange from the Tenth to the Twelfth Century," *Art History* 24:1 (2001): 22 [17-50].
37. May, *Silk Textiles*, 22; Baker, *Islamic Textiles*, 39.
38. On Gilgamesh, see *Al-Andalus*, p. 320 n.2.
39. Oleg and André Grabar, "L'Essor des arts inspirés par les cours princières à la fin du premier millénaire: princes musulmans et princes chrétiens," in *L'Occidente e l'Islam nell'alto Medioevo* (Spoleto: Presso la Sede del Centro, 1965), pp. 846, 882.
40. Their portability "destabilized and dislocated works from their original sites of production [and] re-mapped geographical and cultural boundaries." Eva Hoffman, "Pathways of Portability," 17. Medieval producers themselves were not above profiting from the ambiguities, as in the case of the "Burgo de Osma" silk, a twelfth-century knock-off which bears an inscription reading "made in Baghdad," though technical features of its weave and orthography make Almería its probable site of production. See *Art of Medieval Spain*, pp. 108-9.
41. Grabar, "Shared Culture," pp. 608-9. On the importance of the so-called "minor arts" in the Islamic world, see Jonathan Bloom and Sheila Blair, *Islamic Arts* (London: Phaidon Press, 1997), p. 10.
42. The term *muqarnas* refers to the distinctive stalactite or honeycomb vaulting widespread in Islamic architecture between the eleventh and fifteenth centuries. For their development and symbolic associations, see Yasser Tabbaa, *The Transformation of Islamic Art during the Sunni Revival* (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 2001), chapter 5. William Tronzo, *The Cultures of His Kingdom: Roger II and the Cappella Palatina in Palermo* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1997), pp. 142-43, *Trésors fatimides du Caire*, pp. 220-21; *Eredità dell'Islam: arte islamica in Italia*, ed. Giovanni Curatola and Bianca Maria Alfieri (Venice: Silvana, 1993), pp. 205-7. Specific borrowings from Fatimid Egypt included Roger's royal titlature, palace design, chancery script, and iconographic programs and inscriptions. Long recognized as Arabic, they were assumed to be survivals of earlier Sicilian practices. However, in "The Norman Kings of Sicily and the Fatimid Caliphate," *Anglo-Norman Studies* 15 (1992): 133-59, Jeremy Johns demonstrates their direct links to contemporary Fatimid forms.
43. On the conflicting interpretations given the lion/camel motif, see William Tronzo, "The Mantle of Roger II of Sicily" in *Robes of Honor*, pp. 241-53.
44. For example, *Western Societies: A Documentary History*, ed. Brian Tierney and Joan Scott (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1984), whose chapter on "Medieval Monarchies" is divided into sections on England (four entries), France, and the Empire (one each). In Robert S. Lopez, *The Birth of Europe* (New York: M. Evans, 1967), Sicily is listed among the "Smaller Powers," even though, at the beginning of the twelfth century, "the Norman state was unusually prosperous and Palermo, its capital, surpassed all other Catholic cities in population, size, and magnificence. Nowhere else could one have found an administration as complex and polyglot yet so capable of unifying the motley components of the population under its control" (p. 244).
45. Robert Bartlett, *The Making of Europe: Conquest, Colonization and Cultural Change 950-1350* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1993).
46. See Samir Amin, *Eurocentrism*, trans. Russell Moore (New York: Monthly Review Press, 1989), pp. 8, 10-11.
47. Beyond its political and linguistic ties to Anglo-Norman England, Sicily was linked to northern France by the dynastic marriages Roger II arranged for his children. His son Roger, who predeceased him (1149), was married to Elizabeth of Champagne, sister of the future Count Henry the Liberal; his eventual

- successor, William I, was married to Margaret of Navarre—cousin of the counts of Perche and Roucy who played so prominent a role in Aragonese politics.
48. S. D. Goitein, "The Unity of the Mediterranean World in the 'Middle' Middle Ages," *Studies in Islamic History & Institutions* (Leiden, the Netherlands: Brill, 1966).
  49. An early twelfth-century Latin life of Saint Gilles represents a Genoese merchant ship caught in a storm while sailing home from Almería. Olivia Remie Constable, "Genoa and Spain in the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries: Notarial Evidence for a Shift in Patterns of Trade," *Journal of European Economic History* 19.3 (1990): 637 [635-56]. In 1143, the archbishop of Genoa established a standard tithe levied on ships arriving from Almería. Steven Epstein, *Genoa and the Genoese, 958-1528* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1996), p. 26.
  50. The year before, the Genoese had seized Almería for themselves. However, the exorbitant tribute they imposed had proved uncollectible. Epstein, *Genoa*, pp. 31-32, 49-51.
  51. On the difference the regime change made in Iberian silk production, see Partearroyo, "Textiles," pp. 109-10.
  52. See Epstein, *Genoa*, pp. 25-6, and Constable, "Genoa and Spain," pp. 635-36, 650.
  53. Sharon Kinoshita, "In the Beginning was the Road: *Floire et Blancheflor* and the Politics of Translation," *Medieval Translator* 8 (forthcoming).
  54. Compare *La Prise de Cordres et de Seville*, which shows an Anglo-Norman fleet docking at Córdoba to stock up on "les chiers dras d'Aumarie" and Syrian horses (l. 2185).
  55. Edward W. Said, *Orientalism* (New York: Random House, 1978), p. 6; Edmund Burke, III, "Towards a Comparative History of the Modern Mediterranean," paper presented at the International Conference on Cosmopolitanism, Human Rights, and Sovereignty in the new Europe," Center for European Studies, University of California, Berkeley, May 4-5, 2001.

### Notes to Chapter Eleven

My gratitude to the American Association of University Women and the Woodrow Wilson National Fellowship Foundation for their generous support of this research.

1. Boethius, *In Porphyrium dialogus primus*, PL 64:2A [1-70].
2. Boethius, *In Porphyrium*, PL 64:2A [1-70].
3. Dante, *Convivio* III.6, trans. Richard Lansing, *Digital Dante*, available at <http://dante.ilt.columbia.edu/books/convivi/index.html> (27 December 2002).
4. Pierre Courcelle, *La Consolation de philosophie dans la tradition littéraire: Antécédents et postérité de Boèce* (Paris: Études Augustiniennes, 1967), p. 22.
5. James J. Paxson, *The Poetics of Personification* (Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press, 1994), p. 98.
6. Boethius, *Consolation*, 5.pr.4. Unless otherwise noted, English translations of Boethius are from *The Consolation of Philosophy*, trans. V. E. Watts (New York: Penguin, 1969). All Latin quotations of Boethius are from *Consolatio Philosophiae*, ed. James O'Donnell (Bryn Mawr, PA: Bryn Mawr Latin Commentaries, 1990).
7. Seth Lerer, "The Search for Voice," in *Boethius and Dialogue* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1985), p. 102.
8. On the Lacanian feminine as the signifier of the Symbolic, see Judith Butler, "Subjects of Sex/Gender/Desire," in *Gender Trouble* (New York: Routledge, 1990),

- p. 27. On woman as the "metaphor of alterity" see Susan Crane, "Adventure," in *Gender and Romance in Chaucer's Canterbury Tales* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1994), pp. 171-72. See also R. Howard Bloch, "Early Christianity and the Estheticization of Gender," in *Medieval Misogyny and the Invention of Western Romantic Love* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1991), pp. 37-63.
9. See Anne Carson, "Dirt and Desire: The Phenomenology of Female Pollution in Antiquity," in *Constructions of the Classical Body*, ed. James I. Porter (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1999), pp. 77-100. Sarah Kay asks a similar question—"How is this denigration of the body as feminine compatible with the deployment of a female agent of revelation?"—in "Women's Body of Knowledge: Epistemology and Misogyny in the *Romance of the Rose*," in *Framing Medieval Bodies*, ed. Sarah Kay and Miri Rubin (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1994), p. 226.
10. By 'body' here, I refer to the material entity identified as Philosophy, understanding that her allegorical status and her lack of fleshly form complicate the term. This is somewhat distinct from my subsequent discussions of her "sartorial body," a phrase I borrow from E. Jane Burns to refer to the combined forces of clothing and body in the construction of identity. My gratitude to Jane Burns for her guidance in refining my terminology. See Burns, *Courtly Love Undressed: Reading Through Clothes in Medieval French Culture* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2002), pp. 12-13, 24-26.
11. On William's commentary see Courcelle, *La Consolation*, pp. 408-10. See also Nikolaus M. Häring, "Commentary and Hermeneutics," in *Renaissance and Renewal in the Twelfth Century*, ed. Robert L. Benson and Giles Constable, with Carol D. Lanham (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1991), p. 188.
12. MS London, B.L. Egerton 628, fol. 166r. Qtd. in Winthrop Wetherbee, *Platonism and Poetry in the Twelfth Century: The Literary Influence of the School of Chartres* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1972), p. 93.
13. 'Purus,' in Charlton T. Lewis, Ph.D. and Charles Short, LL.D, *A Latin Dictionary* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1879).
14. See Richard A. Dwyer's discussion of this addition in "The Tempting Integument," in *Boethian Fictions* (Cambridge, MA: Medieval Academy of America, 1976), pp. 54-55.
15. See above, p. 5 n.10.
16. See Lerer, "The Search for Voice," in *Boethius and Dialogue*, especially pp. 96-110.
17. See Kay, "Women's Body," in *Framing Medieval Bodies*, p. 226.
18. Courcelle, *La Consolation*, pp. 90-99. My subsequent analysis of manuscripts relies on Courcelle's plates and figures.
19. Mary J. Carruthers, "Elementary Memory Design," and "The Arts of Memory," in *The Book of Memory* (Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press, 1990), pp. 109, 142; and "Reading with Attitude," in *The Book and the Body*, ed. Dolores Warwick Frese and Katherine O'Brien O'Keefe (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1997), pp. 2-3.
20. For example MS Paris, Bibliothèque de l'Institut de France, 264, fols. Ir and 54r; MS Oxford, Bodleian Douce 298 fols. 33r and 53v; Courcelle plates 32.1-2 and 33.1-2.
21. MS Oxford, Bodleian Douce 298, fol. 53v; Courcelle plate 33.2.
22. MS Besançon, Bibliothèque Municipale 434, fols. 300v and 321r; and MS Mâcon, Bibliothèque Municipale 95, fols. 84r and 101v; Courcelle plates 31.1, 31.4, and 35.2-3.
23. MSS Paris B.N. *français* 1100, fol. 41v and B.N. *français* 1101, fol. 3v; Courcelle plates 39.1-2.